

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

JENNIE DEVRIES,  Plaintiff,  v.  HOPE COLLEGE,  Defendant.	Case No. 1:22-cv-01224-PLM  Hon. Paul L. Maloney  <b>CLASS ACTION</b>
TRICIA GARNETT,  Plaintiff,  v.  HOPE COLLEGE,  Defendant.	Case No. 1:22-cv-01225-PLM  Hon. Paul L. Maloney  <b>CLASS ACTION</b>
MARK CYPHERS,  Plaintiff,  v.  HOPE COLLEGE,  Defendant.	Case No. 1:23-cv-00013-PLM  Hon. Paul L. Maloney  <b>CLASS ACTION</b>

<p>TIM DROST,</p> <p>Plaintiff,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>HOPE COLLEGE,</p> <p>Defendant.</p>	<p>Case No. 1:23-cv-00078-PLM</p> <p>Hon. Paul L. Maloney</p> <p><b>CLASS ACTION</b></p>
<p>JOSEPH O. RODGERS,</p> <p>Plaintiff,</p> <p>v.</p> <p>HOPE COLLEGE,</p> <p>Defendant.</p>	<p>Case No. 1:23-cv-00109-PLM</p> <p>Hon. Paul L. Maloney</p> <p><b>CLASS ACTION</b></p>

**JOINT MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE CASES  
AND SET A SCHEDULE FOR THE FILING OF A  
CONSOLIDATED AMENDED COMPLAINT**

Plaintiffs in the Related Cases—described in full below—and Defendant Hope College (“Hope” or “Defendant”) jointly move the Court for an order consolidating these five filed related cases pending in this District pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a). The parties further seek Court approval of their agreed upon schedule for the filing of a single consolidated amended complaint. In support of their motion, the Related Cases Plaintiffs and Hope state as follows:

1. Between December 26, 2023 and January 30, 2023, five class actions were filed in this District against Defendant Hope concerning a data security incident that Hope announced on or around December 15, 2022. The complaints in each of these cases allege that Hope failed to adequately safeguard the sensitive personal identifying information of Plaintiffs and putative Class Members, and assert various state law claims. These actions, and the dates on which they were filed, are set forth below:

- *Devries v. Hope College*, Case No. 1:22-cv-01224 (“*Devries*”), filed December 26, 2022 and currently pending before the Hon. Paul L. Maloney;
- *Garnett v. Hope College*, Case No. 1:22-cv-01225 (“*Garnett*”), filed December 27, 2022 and currently pending before the Hon. Paul L. Maloney; and
- *Cyphers v. Hope College*, Case No. 1:23-cv-00013 (“*Cyphers*”), filed January 5, 2023 and currently pending before the Hon. Paul L. Maloney;

- *Drost v. Hope College*, Case No. 1:23-cv-00078 (“*Drost*”), filed January 20, 2023 and currently pending before the Hon. Paul L. Maloney; and
- *Rodgers v. Hope College*, Case No. 1:23-cv-00109 (“*Rodgers*”), filed January 30, 2023 and currently pending before the Hon. Paul L. Maloney (collectively, the “Related Cases”).

2. Plaintiffs in all of the Related Cases and Defendant Hope College jointly move the Court for an order consolidating these cases pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a). Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a) provides that “[i]f actions before the court involve a common issue of law or fact, the court may: (1) join for hearing or trial any or all matters at issue in the actions; (2) consolidate the actions; or (3) issue any other orders to avoid unnecessary cost of delay.”

3. The Related Cases satisfy this criteria. The complaints in each of them raise common questions of law and fact, arise from the same data security incident at the same defendant, are brought on behalf of substantially identical classes, and allege that Hope failed to adequately safeguard the sensitive personal identifying information of Plaintiffs and putative Class Members.

4. Pursuant to LCivR 7.1(d), counsel for Plaintiffs in the Related Cases have conferred amongst themselves and with counsel for Hope, and agree that consolidation of the Related Cases is appropriate under Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a). The parties have also agreed to a schedule for the filing of an operative consolidated

amended complaint, and to relieve Hope of the duty to respond to the various initial complaints filed in these actions in the interim.

5. A Proposed Order is attached as **Exhibit 1**, and a Certificate pursuant to LCivR 7.1(d) will be filed concurrently with this Motion.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs in the Related Cases and Defendant Hope respectfully request that this Court enter an Order, substantially in the form attached as **Exhibit 1**, and consolidate this case with the Related Cases, all of which are presently assigned to the Hon. Paul L. Maloney, enter the proposed deadlines to file the operative consolidated amended complaint, and to stay the deadline for Hope to respond to the individual complaints.

Dated: February 10, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ E. Powell Miller

E. Powell Miller (P39487)

Sharon S. Almonrode (P33938)

Emily E. Hughes (P68724)

**THE MILLER LAW FIRM**

950 W. University Drive, Suite 300

Rochester, MI 48307

T: (248) 841-2200

epm@millerlawpc.com

ssa@millerlawpc.com

eeh@millerlawpc.com

**SHUB LAW FIRM LLC**

Jonathan Shub

Benjamin F. Johns

Samantha E. Holbrook

134 Kings Hwy. E., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

Haddonfield, NJ 08033  
T: (856) 772-7200  
jshub@shublawayers.com  
bjohns@shublawayers.com  
sholbrook@shublawayers.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Jennie Devries*

/s/ Charles R. Ash, IV (w/consent)

**ASH LAW, PLLC**  
Charles R. Ash, IV (P73877)  
402 W. Liberty St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48178  
T: (734) 234-5583  
cash@nationalwagelaw.com

**MARKOVITS, STOCK &  
DEMARCO, LLC**  
Terence R. Coates  
Justin C. Walker  
Dylan J. Gould  
119 E. Court Street, Suite 530  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
T: (513) 651-3700  
F: (513) 665-0219  
tcoates@msdlegal.com  
jwalker@msdlegal.com  
dgould@msdlegal.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Tricia Garnett*

/s/ Charles R. Ash, IV (w/consent)

**ASH LAW, PLLC**  
Charles R. Ash, IV (P73877)  
402 W. Liberty St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48178  
T: (734) 234-5583  
cash@nationalwagelaw.com

**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON**

**PHILLIPS GROSSMAN, PLLC**

Gary M. Klinger  
227 W. Monroe Street, Suite 2100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
T: (866) 252-0878  
gklinger@milberg.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Mark Cyphers*

/s/ Philip J. Krzeski (w/consent)

**CHESTNUT CAMBRONNE PA**

Bryan L. Bleichner  
Philip J. Krzeski  
100 Washington Avenue South,  
Suite 1700  
Minneapolis, MN 55401  
Phone: (612) 339-7300  
bbleichner@chestnutcambronne.com  
pkrzeski@chestnutcambronne.com

**THE LYON LAW FIRM, LLC**

Joseph M. Lyon  
2754 Erie Ave.  
Cincinnati, OH 45208  
Phone: (513) 381-2333  
Fax: (513) 766-9011  
jlyon@thelyonfirm.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Tim Drost*

/s/ E. Powell Miller

E. Powell Miller (P39487)  
Sharon S. Almonrode (P33938)  
Emily E. Hughes (P68724)  
**THE MILLER LAW FIRM**  
950 W. University Drive, Suite 300  
Rochester, MI 48307  
T: (248) 841-2200  
epm@millerlawpc.com  
ssa@millerlawpc.com

eeh@millerlawpc.com

**SHUB LAW FIRM LLC**

Jonathan Shub

Benjamin F. Johns

Samantha E. Holbrook

134 Kings Hwy. E., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

Haddonfield, NJ 08033

T: (856) 772-7200

jshub@shublawayers.com

bjohns@shublawayers.com

sholbrook@shublawayers.com

**LOWEY DANNENBERG, P.C.**

Christian Levis

Amanda G. Fiorilla

44 South Broadway, Suite 1100

White Plains, NY 10601

T: (914) 997-0500

clevis@lowey.com

afiorilla@lowey.com

Anthony M. Christina

One Tower Bridge 100 Front Street,  
Suite 520

West Conshohocken, PA 19428

T: (215) 399-4770

achristina@lowey.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Joseph O. Rodgers*

/s/ Craig T. Liljestrand (w/consent)

**Hinshaw & Culbertson LLP**

Craig T. Liljestrand

151 North Franklin Street

Suite 2500

Chicago, IL 60606

T: 312-704-3647

cliljestrand@hinshawlaw.com



Jill H. Fertel  
**CIPRIANI & WERNER PC**  
450 SENTRY PARKWAY  
SUITE 200  
BLUE BELL, PA 19422  
(610) 567-0700  
JFertel@c-wlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Hope College*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on February 10, 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing document(s) using the Court's electronic filing system, which will notify all counsel of record authorized to receive such filings.

/s/ E. Powell Miller

E. Powell Miller (P39487)

**THE MILLER LAW FIRM, P.C.**

950 W. University Dr., Ste. 300

Rochester, MI 48307

Tel: (248) 841-2200

epm@millerlawpc.com